

ISSN 2454-3314

# THE INVESTIGATOR

An International Peer-Reviewed Journal of Multidisciplinary Explorations  
(Vol. 9, No. 2) June 2023



**Association for Cultural & Scientific Research**

**ISSN 2454-3314**

**THE INVESTIGATOR**

An International Peer-Reviewed Journal of Multidisciplinary Explorations  
(Vol. 9, No. 2) June 2023



**Association for Cultural & Scientific Research**

Thrissur, Kerala, India-680689

[www.acsrinternational.com](http://www.acsrinternational.com)

## Editorial Board

Editor-in-Chief

Dr Lison Varghese

Associate Editor

Dr Soumy Syamchand

Editors

Dr. Alan Johnson, Professor, Idaho State University, USA

Dr Debarchana Baruch, University of Oxford

Dr Melahat S.D, Professor, TOBB University, Turkey

Suja Selvanose, Govt Teacher Education College, Trivandrum

Dr R. Vasuhi, MS University, Tirunelveli

Dr A. Selvaraj, Annamalai University, Chidambaram

Teeson C.J, Assistant Professor, Jain University

Dr Kashmir Mehta, Kachchh University, Gujarat

Advisory Board

Dr R. Janatha Kumari, Sree Ayyappa College, Nagercoil

Dr Latha Nair R., St Teresa's College, Ernakulam

Dr Sugandhyasree Bhattacharjee, MSSV, Assam

Reviewers

Amani Abdo Farhan Mohammed, Thamar University, Republic of Yemen

Dr Priya K. Nair, St Teresa's College, Ernakulam

The Investigator

(An International Peer-Reviewed Journal of Multidisciplinary Explorations)

Vol. 9, No. 2, June 2023

Published by: Association for Cultural & Scientific Research (ACSR)

Thrissur, Kerala-680689, India

Printed at: educare, Periodicity: Quarterly

All rights reserved

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including, photocopy, recording or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Editor's Note

*The Investigator* is an International Peer-Reviewed Multidisciplinary Journal published quarterly (March, June, September and December), launched under the auspices of the academic community *Association for Cultural & Scientific Research* (ACSR). Keeping the panoramic scopes of research as a vibrant path, *The Investigator* intends to reflect on the skilled minds attitudinally conjuring from humanities to other disciplines. The journal explores the currents of criticism and unleashes divergent thinking. It welcomes original, scholarly unpublished papers from the researchers, faculty members, students and the diverse aspirants writing in English. It is a peer reviewed journal that brings the scholarship of academicians and practitioners around the world. *The Investigator* hopes and wishes to provide a self assuring means to you for your further accomplishments.

## CONTENTS

Psycho-spiritual Enhancement in Reducing Stress among Consecrated Indian Women <b>Dr Mini Kuruvila</b>	1
Role of Information and Communication Technology in Teaching and Learning <b>Reshmi Alex</b> <b>Nisha M.</b>	7
<i>Spectacle Galore</i> <b>Dr Babu Rajan P. P</b>	15
The Problem of Truth in Indian Knowledge Analysis <b>Dr Savithri A.</b>	20
Conceptualizing Male Gaze in Movies <b>Dr Suresh Babu G.</b>	37
Indian Role in the Indian Ocean Rim Association <b>Dr Krishnamurthy N. P.</b>	43

**Dr Mini Kuruvila**

Administrator, St Andrew Catholic Hospital, Ghana

## **Psycho-spiritual Enhancement in Reducing Stress among Consecrated Indian Women**

*The lives of consecrated women are distinguished by enormous risks and challenges in India. Regardless of its secular and democratic nature, the socio-political scenario of the country is unfavorable to consecrated women due to Hindu fundamentalism and extremism. The consecrated women, who work in different fields in North India, experience increased level of perceived stress as they are continuously exposed to complex situation. This is one of the contributing factors that affect their commitment and mission. Therefore, the current study aimed to develop an intervention program called Psycho-Spiritual Enhancement Strategies (PSES) which intends to reduce the perceived stress and enhance the spiritual quotient of the consecrated women in India. The enhanced spiritual quotient can help the individual perceive the events/ experiences in a better way to find a more in-depth meaning of it.*

India is the home of a majority of religions of the world, such as Hinduism, Islam, Christianity, Buddhism, Jainism and Sikhism. What characterizes Indian society is its diverse culture, peoples and languages. Diversity of religious faiths has existed over a period of time since India is a country with very ancient history and it is also a place where people from other countries settled down. Together with diverse cultural groups and various religions in India presuming their faiths, these immigrant communities also brought their own religious faiths, customs and cultures. This resulted in bringing together people following different religions and gradually laid the basis of religious pluralism in India. In 1947, when India became an independent nation, the idea of secular nationalism brought by the leaders of Mahatma Gandhi and Jawaharlal Nehru became the foundation for the unity of pluralistic India (Thomas, 1997). The country has always been portrayed as a land of spiritual integrity where philosophers stress the magnanimity of its secular nationalism.

However, the Vedic culture which originated in India roughly between 1500 and 600 BC gives a notion that India is a 'Hindu' country. The Hindu fundamentalists claim that India belongs to Hindus, who comprise the majority of the Indian population which is more than 80% of 1.21 billion of the total population of India (Census of India, 2011). Hinduism has a strong influence on the social and political spheres of India. By tradition, which really has a Hindu basis, the Indian society has been hierarchically arranged and the different communities and caste groups have shown a pattern of social distance in which low caste, tribal and minority groups have been discriminated. Culture likewise shows its uniqueness from state to state and from south India to North India (Das N.K, 2009). The socio-political, economic and religious diversity has tremendous impact on its inhabitants

particularly people in North India who go through great social and political struggles (Craig, Jeffrey, 2000) while the caste system and social inequality, illiteracy, poverty and gender discrimination still prevail in greater parts of North India. People live in rural areas where the literacy rate is very low which makes them victims of exploitation by politicians and social elites who are in power.

India is the largest democracy in the world with the biggest number of people with franchise rights and the largest number of political parties. Since there are several political parties, there are also many political issues in Indian politics. There are political issues on both national and regional levels caused by the ideological differences of political parties. Some political parties just demand for more economic and social rights for their communities, while others demand for more autonomy for their cultures within the Indian states. The recent history of the democratic politics in North India has been characterized by the politicization of caste identities, the increasing participation of lower castes in the political process (Craig, Jeffrey, 2000).

In the recent decades, the changes in Indian economy are striking and have been constantly projected before the world, leading to incomparable expectations about the Indian economy. The government has designed a viable national target for the country's transformation to become a developed nation by 2020 (Roddam, Narasimha, 2008). On the contrary, officially, 37% of India's total population lives below the poverty line and 75% of them are living in rural areas (BBC News, May, 2011). A major cause of poverty among India's rural people, both individuals and communities, is lack of access to productive assets and financial resources. High levels of illiteracy, inadequate health care and extremely limited access to social services are common among the poor rural people of North India.

Women and men are equally important for the growth and development of individual and social lives. With regard to the status of women in Indian society, no nation has held their women in higher esteem than the Hindus. History shows that during the Vedic period the status of women was honorable and respectable (Nirupama, Prakash, 2003). But the situation now particularly in Northern India is different as the women are subjected to discrimination in learning, dowry deaths and domestic violence. According to Sharma (2005), women are subjected to atrocities of many types like physical violence, sexual violence, verbal violence, social violence, emotional violence, financial violence etc in a male dominated society.

Despite the diverse situation in India, Christianity has a marked role in the development of the nation and in social reconstruction. Tradition traces the beginning of Christianity in India with the arrival of the apostle, St. Thomas in 52 AD and so Christianity in India is as old as world Christianity. There are 25

million Christians in India which is just below 3% of the total population of the country (census of India, 2001). According to the Catholic Bishops Conference of India (CBCI, 2010), the current statistics of the Catholics in India total: 15,515,046, Bishops 165, Dioceses 128, Priests 19040, and Consecrated People 52640. The Congregations of the consecrated people in India are comprised of natively originated and those from abroad. Among the 282 congregations, 100 are of Indian and 182 of foreign origin (Vallipalam, Mathew, 2001).

According to the Canon Law of the Catholic Church (Canon Law c. 410), the consecrated people/consecrated women are those who closely follow Christ totally dedicating themselves through public vows of obedience, chastity and poverty, observed according to the norms of the statutes of the congregation. In India, the consecrated women are engaged in a number of apostolic activities such as education, welfare services, health services and social services for the betterment of the people irrespective of religion and caste (Vallipalam, Mathew, 2001). Because of Christianity in India, the Christian missionaries have a major influence in the history of India particularly in its developmental activities (Hayden, Bellenoit (2007).

The major works of the consecrated people transform the society which is an undeniable fact. Their remarkable work in the field of education and other welfare services make people from rural areas become aware of their rights and they become consequently a threat to political leaders and powerful men from high caste who take advantage of the ignorance of the poor (MathewVallipalam,2001). However, the excellent contributions have been geared towards the resolution of several social issues and social problems that benefit dalit, tribal, women, children, laborers, and youth, the sick and the elderly.

Nevertheless, in recent decades the consecrated people in India have received threats. Religious freedom as a marked right of Indian democracy and citizenship is being questioned now (Jennifer, Coleman, 2008). Hindu nationalism as a result of social and political consolidation of the Hindu Rights is conservative and aggressivel communalistic. Verbal and physical attacks on Christians and other minority groups is an explicit example (Emma, Mawdsley, 2005). Attack against Christians in Orissa (Asia News, July 9, 2008), gang rape of a young Nun and attack against a priest in Orissa (The Hindu, September 30, 2008), attacks against Christians in Karnataka (Compass Direct News, March 22,2009), violence in Madhya Pradesh (*The Hindu, September 29, 1998*), attacks on nuns and priests of the Missionaries of Charity in Kerala (BBC News, September 26, 2004), Priests, students and a nun attacked in Gujarat (Persecution Update India, 2008) Catholic Religious Brother murdered in Utterpradesh (Avemaria bravepages, June 7, 2000) , Sister Rani Maria, martyr of the faith (Asia Net News, April 17, 2010), and death of

Sr.Valsa John in Jharkhand (Expressindia, Nov 16, 2011) are some of the major incidents that had happened in recent years. These events signify the impact of the unfavorable socio-political circumstances faced by the Church in India. Consecrated people, particularly the consecrated women, become victims of violence. Hence, the researcher wanted to conduct a study among the consecrated people in India who have committed their life to work in such a troubled social scenario. Socio-political problems, personal inadequacies, individualism, influence of modernism make the lives more stressful and diminish their effectiveness with regard to their commitment and mission.

According to previous studies stressful life and work experiences are harmful to health. Environmental stressors and challenges can activate physiologic responses at cellular and systemic levels. (Castro, et al., 2010). Even though the studies prove, stressors and physiological response are linked; the importance of the subjective appraisal of the individual has to be acknowledged (Noreen Goldman, Dana Gleib, Christopher Seplaki, Wen Liu, & Maxine Weinstein, 2005). Psychologists like Denson et al. (2009) have recognized that there is considerable variation in how people respond to equivalent stressors. It is apparent among the consecrated women that there will be individual differences in how they construe or appraise the stressor and its consequences which are important contributors to the variability in psychological and physiological responses.

Marleen Van Eck et al. (1996) argue that daily events or situations experienced as stressful were associated with increased cortisol secretion. According to the Psychoneuroimmunology (PNI), researches provide evidence that one of the main mechanisms by which stress affects immune functioning is through activation of the hypothalamus–pituitary–adrenal (HPA) axis (Cutuli et al., Sonia Lupien et al.,2009).

The Psychoneuroimmunological researches done by Richard and Potts (1995) demonstrate the physiological effects of stress and relaxation, increase awareness of physical and emotional responses to stress, and how to shift one's stress response through an integrated approach of psycho-spiritual, reframing unhealthy thought patterns. For many years, an interdisciplinary effort has been exerted to develop a spiritual orientation or strategy in psychology and psychotherapy. It has been suggested that such an orientation can make unique contributions to the psychotherapeutic endeavor by providing a spiritual conception of human nature and personality.

Further more studies authenticate the spiritual and religious domain as significantly associated with many aspects of adaptive functioning such as the significant relationships between religious/spiritual functioning and achieving a sense of meaning in life maintaining a sense of hope and optimism, coping with life's difficulties and dealing constructively with one's own mortality



(William Hathaway, Stacey Scott, and Stacey Garver, 2004). Therefore, the current study focuses on the enhancement of the spiritual quotient (SQ) of the consecrated women, exploring how the SQ is related to reducing the perceived stress. Danah Zohar (2000) describes that SQ is an ability to reframe or re-contextualize our experience, and thus an ability to transform our understanding of it.

Danah Zohar and Ian Marshall, (2000) further state that it is not necessary SQ has some connection to religion. Being religious doesn't guarantee high SQ as many humanists and atheists have high SQ and very actively religious people have low SQ. Spiritual Quotient can make people more religious but it doesn't depend on religion. It is the ultimate intelligence by which people can heal themselves and make themselves as a whole. SQ makes us aware that we have existential problems and it enables us to solve it. SQ allows us to integrate the intrapersonal and interpersonal relatively making us to understand who we are and the potential to understand the other. Danah Zohar (2000) writes 'a person high in SQ is likely to be a servant leader- someone who is responsible for bringing higher vision and value to others and showing them how to use it, in other words a person who inspires others' (p. 16). John Paul II in his Apostolic Exhortation *Vita Consecrata* (*Vita Consecrata*. 72) points out that the life of the consecrated women are meant to be deeply adhesive on prayer as God calls them to follow Him, make them consecrated and are sent into the world to imitate His example and to continue his mission. Therefore, it is the urgent need of the times to enhance the SQ of the consecrated women to face the difficulty of new situations with the serenity and with intensified virtue of their dedication to live in fullness and in joy, and in a very special way to be the signs of God's tender love towards the human race and special witnesses to the mystery of the Church.

Although the expression of the consecration of the virgins was common in the fourth century (Samuel Canilang, 2005) the Second Vatican Council was the most momentous juncture for renewing the identity and mission of the consecrated people/ consecrated women in the church for the world. The Church continues to be evident even today. Therefore, in recent years, following the Second Vatican Council, new or renewed forms of the consecrated life have arisen (*Vita Consecrata*.12). Consecrated women, by their particular form of consecration, are necessarily and deeply committed to the mission of Christ which is more challenging in India due to religious pluralism and modern secularizing tendencies. Hence the current study is significant to improve the life of the consecrated women for them to be successful in their consecration and mission by enhancing their spiritual quotient. The study is thus, anchored exclusively among the consecrated women in India, considering the social, economic, political, religious and cultural characteristics of a non-Catholic country.

Psycho-Spiritual Enhancement Strategies are expertly designed on the basis of psychoneuroimmunology (PNI), which is a multidisciplinary approach assimilating mind and body to enhance SQ and reduce perceived stress. Psychologists integrate Christian values and interventions such as prayer, discussion of scripture, and forgiveness with secular approaches such as cognitive-behavioral. The strategies are incorporated cognitive behavioural approaches like cognitive restructuring through the psychological education and exercises based on the idea that our thoughts cause our feelings and behaviors, not external things, like people, situations, and events. The benefit of this realization can change the way we think to feel or act better even if the situation does not change.

Human beings are created by God and their physical, emotional and spiritual healths are interconnected. Imbalances in any of these areas can lead to distress. Wholeness and maturity comes through right relationships with God, self, and others. Past emotional hurts and wounds often prevent individuals from relating well to others, God and even themselves. Hence, the spiritual interventions such as singing meditation, yoga, Bible reflections, imagery and healing of the stages of life can be essential to facilitating recovery and change in the perception of situations and daily life events.

#### References

- Altazar Rossiter. (2006). *Developing Spiritual Intelligence: The Power of You*. UK. John Hunt Publishing Ltd.
- Anne Myers and Christine Hansen. (2006). *Experimental Psychology*. 6th edition. USA, Wadsworth Cengage Learning.
- John P. Pinel. (2009). *Biopsychology*. 7th Edition. USA, Pearson Education Inc.
- Joshua M. Gold. (2010). *counseling and Spirituality : integrating Spiritual and Clinical Orientations*. USA, Merrill.
- Martin H. Padovani. (2006). *Healing Wounded Emotions, Overcoming Life's Hurts*. Manila, Logos Publication Inc.
- Mathew Linn, SJ, Sheila Fabricant, Dennis Linn. (1994). *Healing the Eight Stages of Life*. USA, St. Paul's Publications.

**Reshmi Alex**

Assistant Professor of Commerce  
KVM College of Arts and Science, Cherthala

**Nisha M.**

Assistant Professor of Commerce  
KVM College of Arts and Science, Cherthala

**Role of Information and Communication Technology  
in Teaching and Learning**

*Many people recognize ICTs as catalysts for change; change in working conditions, handling and exchanging information, teaching methods, learning approaches, scientific research, and in accessing information. ICT has been introduced into education over the last 25 years. The effective integration of this technology into classroom practices poses a challenge to teachers and administrators. This empirical study aimed at finding out the factors influencing use of ICT to make teaching learning effective in higher institutions of learning in Alappuzha and identifying the innovations that ICT has brought into teaching-learning process. Pedagogy and Learning with ICT explores the possibilities for change in education systems arising from young people's enthusiasm for ICT and their ability to rapidly acquire skills in its use through exploratory play. This paper focuses on how technology can transform the routine practices of schools to make learning more exciting and engaging. The 'art' of innovation involves teachers and teacher educators in the creative, collaborative process of imagining, experimenting with, and evaluating new pedagogies. Keywords: ICT, Teaching-Learning, Higher Institutions of learning, Pedagogy*

Information and Communication Technology can lead to improved student learning and better teaching methods. A report made by the National Institute of Multimedia Education(NIME) in Japan, proved that an increase in student exposure to educational ICT through curriculum integration has a significant and positive impact on student achievement, especially in terms of "Knowledge Comprehension", "Practical skill" and "Presentation skill" in subject areas such as Mathematics, Science, and Social Studies.

ICT is often associated with sophisticated technologies. But ICT also includes the conventional technologies, such as, radio, television and telephone. In today's networked society, the technology used is often blended, and we use multiple technologies simultaneously. We use satellite, internet and video conferencing facilities to connect with people who may be across different geographical locations (Reddi – 2004). Through the application of ICT, one can diminish the impact of space, time and distance.

Determine factors influencing use of ICT to make teaching learning effective in higher institutions of learning in Alappuzha. Identify the innovations that ICT has brought in teaching learning process in higher institutions of learning in Alappuzha. The data was collected from newspaper clippings, Reports on ICT published by Central institute of Educational Technology and in conversation with experts in this field. Education should meet the needs of variety of learners and teachers; therefore ICT is important in meeting this need

In order to cope up with the digital culture the educational institutions are adopting modern technologies of ICT to create the teaching and learning environment. To manage the organisation data, accessing the information, maintaining their financial transaction, library services, etc. require adopting latest tools and techniques of ICT in the premises to provide the best services. Recently, the Govt. of India has launched SWAYAM portal which given the online reading material, video, in different courses and using ICT tools to provide education to the outreach. Hence this study enables to understand the factors affecting ICT implemenation and provides the necessary solution for it.

Teachers remain central to the learning process. A shift in the role of a teacher utilizing ICTs to that of a facilitator does not obviate the need for teachers to serve as leaders in the classroom; traditional teacher leadership skills and practices are still important (especially those related to lesson planning, preparation, and follow-up). Lesson planning is crucial when using ICTs. Teacher lesson planning is vital when using ICTs; where little planning has occurred, research shows that student work is often unfocused and can result in lower attainment.

Introducing technology alone will not change the teaching and learning process. The existence of ICTs does not transform teacher practices in and of itself. However, ICTs can enable teachers to transform their teacher practices, given a set of enabling conditions. Teachers' pedagogical practices and reasoning influence their uses of ICT, and the nature of teacher ICT use impacts student achievement.

ICTs seen as tools to help teachers create more 'learner-centric' learning environments. The most effective uses of ICT are those in which the teacher, aided by ICTs, can challenge pupils' understanding and thinking, either through whole-class discussions and individual/small group work using ICTs.

ICTs are seen as important tools to enable and support the move from traditional 'teacher-centric' teaching styles to more 'learner-centric' methods.

ICTs can be used to support change and to support/extend existing teaching practices. Pedagogical practices of teachers using ICT can range from only small enhancements of teaching practices using what are essentially traditional methods, to more fundamental changes in their approach to teaching. ICTs can be used to reinforce existing pedagogical practices as well as to change the way teachers and students interact.

Using ICTs as tools for information presentation is of mixed effectiveness. The use of ICTs as presentation tools (through overhead and LCD projectors, television, electronic whiteboards, guided "web-tours", where students simultaneously view the same resources on computer screens) is seen to be of mixed effectiveness. While it may promote class understanding of and discussion about difficult concepts (especially through the display of simulations), such uses of ICTs can re-enforce traditional pedagogical practices and divert focus from the content of what is being discussed or displayed to the tool being utilized.

Teachers most commonly use ICTs for administrative tasks Teachers most often use ICTs for 'routine tasks' (record keeping, lesson plan development, information presentation, basic information searches on the Internet). More knowledgeable teachers rely less on "computer-assisted instruction" Teachers more knowledgeable in ICTs use utilize computer-assisted instruction less than other teachers who use ICTs, but utilize ICTs more overall. How teachers use ICTs is dependent on their general teaching styles Types of usage of ICTs correlate with teacher pedagogical philosophies. Teachers who use ICTs the most -- and the most effectively -- are less likely to use traditional 'transmission-method' pedagogies. Teachers who use more types of software tend to practice more "constructivist" pedagogies. Teaching with ICTs takes more time .Introducing and using ICTs to support teaching and learning is time-consuming for teachers, both as they attempt to shift pedagogical practices and strategies and when such strategies are used regularly. Simply put: Teaching with ICTs takes more time (estimates vary on how much extra time is required to cover the same material; 10% is a common estimate).

Few teachers are confident in using a wide range of ICT resources, and limited confidence affects the way the lesson is conducted. In OECD countries, many teachers still fear using ICTs, and thus are reluctant to use them in their teaching. At least initially, exposure to ICTs can be an important motivation tool to promote and enable teacher professional development. Teachers require additional motivation and incentives to participate actively in professional development activities. A variety of incentives can be used, including certification, professional advancement, pay increases, paid time off to participate in professional development, formal and informal recognition at the school and community levels and among peers, reduced isolation, and enhanced productivity. The most significant factor for continuing the development of teachers' ICT-related skills is for them to have regular access to functioning and relevant ICT equipment.

Teachers' subject knowledge influences how ICTs are used: The way ICT is used in lessons is influenced by teacher knowledge about their subjects, and how ICT resources can be utilized and related to it. Teacher content mastery and understanding of student comprehension make ICT use more effective. The evidence shows that when teachers use their knowledge of both the subject and the way pupils understood the subject, their use of ICT has a more direct effect on student achievement. Exposure to new/additional information via ICTs is not enough. The effect on attainment is greatest when pupils are challenged to think and to question their own understanding, rather than on exposure to new and additional information. ICTs can aid teacher self-learning in subject matter. By providing access to updated and additional learning resources, ICTs can enable teacher self-learning in his/her subject area.

On-going teacher training and support is critical to the successful utilization of ICTs in education. Teacher training and professional development is seen as the key driver for the successful usage of ICTs in education. Teacher professional development is a process, not an event. Traditional one-time teacher training workshops have not been seen as effective in helping teachers to feel comfortable using ICTs, let alone in integrating it successfully into their teaching. Discrete, 'one-off' training events are seen as less effective than on-going professional development activities. Introducing ICTs expands the needs for on-going professional development of teachers. Effective ICT use in education increases teachers' training and professional development needs.

However, ICTs can be important tools to help meet such increased needs, by helping to provide access to more and better educational content, aid in routine administrative tasks, provide models and simulations of effective teaching practices, and enable learner support networks, both in face to face and distance learning environments, and in real time or asynchronously. Successful teacher professional development models can be divided into three phases Successful on-going professional development models can be divided into three phases: pre-service, focusing on initial preparation on pedagogy, subject mastery, management skills and use of various teaching tools (including ICTs); in-service, including structured face-to-face and distance learning opportunities building upon pre-service training and directly relevant to teacher needs; and on-going formal and informal pedagogical and technical support, enabled by ICTs, for teachers, targeting daily needs and challenges. Effective teacher professional development should model effective teaching practices Effective teacher professional development should approximate the classroom environment as much as possible. "Hands-on" instruction on ICT use is necessary where ICT is deemed to be a vital component of the teaching and learning process. In addition, professional development activities should model effective practices and behaviors and encourage and support collaboration between teachers. On-going professional development at the school level, using available ICT facilities, is seen as a key driver for success, especially when focused on the resources and skills directly relevant to teachers' everyday needs and practices.

Training in assessment methods is important Professional development should include methods for evaluating and modifying pedagogical practices and expose teachers to a variety of assessment methods. Effective professional development requires substantial planning. A needs assessment should precede the creation of and participation in teacher professional development activities, regular monitoring and evaluation should occur of these activities, and feedback loops should be established, if professional development is to be effective and targeted to the needs of teachers. On-going, regular support for teachers is crucial. On-going and regular support is essential to support teacher professional development and can be facilitated through the use of ICTs (in the form of websites, discussion groups, e-mail communities, radio or television broadcasts).

A variety of changes must be implemented to optimize teacher use of ICTs. Shifting pedagogies, redesigning the curriculum and assessment, and providing more autonomy to the schools help to optimize the use of ICT. With

sufficient enabling factors in place, teachers can utilize ICTs in as 'constructivist' a manner as their pedagogical philosophies would permit. Functioning technical infrastructure is (obviously) crucial Teachers must have adequate access to functioning computers, and be provided with sufficient technical support if they are to use ICTs effectively. Introducing ICTs takes time adequate time must be allowed for teachers to develop new skills, explore their integration into their existing teaching practices and curriculum, and undertake necessary additional lesson planning if ICTs are to be used effectively. Support from school administration and the community can be important Support of school administrators and, in some cases, the surrounding community, for teacher use of ICTs is seen as critical if ICTs are to be used at all, let alone effectively. For this reason, targeted outreach to both groups is often necessary if investments in ICTs to support education are to be optimized. Communities of practice can be important tools to support teacher professional development. The existence of formal and informal communities of practice and peer networks can be important tools to support ICT in education initiatives and activities. Such support mechanisms can be facilitated through the use of ICTs. Lessons learned from introducing ICTs in education need to be shared. As the introduction of ICTs to aid education is often part of a larger change or reform process, it is vital that successful uses of ICTs are promoted and disseminated.

There are multiple issues and challenges confronting the implementation of ICT education in schools and educational institutions and the problems are much more magnified in case of schools located rural and remote area when the access to electricity and internet are next to impossible. The biggest challenge is the need for constant renewal in terms of content. The policy makers, educators, administrators and students in higher education are facing certain challenges like, Environmental challenges, Educational challenges and Cultural challenges.

**Environmental challenges:** There is restriction on infrastructure area for the complete ICTs integration in education. So it becomes very significant for policy makers and planners before any development of ICT in education. Few things which we have to keep in mind when we implement ICT in education like proper classrooms and buildings need to be available for the latest technology as well as availability of telephony and electricity

**Educational challenges:** It is one of the biggest challenges to develop ICT in education because of balancing educational goals with financial realities. In



education, ICTs need huge amount of investments. Additional effort and time required to train teaching manpower, motivate educators and integrate ICT as a tool into their curriculum. In short, development of ICT in education requires to establishment facilities with appropriate infrastructure and adaptation of the latest technologies

Cultural challenges: English is the foremost language of the internet. Miscellanies of culture in different area of the world are also challenges to introducing ICT in education. Almost 80% of online content, educational software are in English. English is not the first language in most of the countries. So it denotes a serious obstacle to integrating ICTs use in education system. For example, in India and Pakistan, almost all the websites are in English. Thus, some people may not access the information due to lack of in English efficiency.

From research findings and discussions on the role of ICT to make teaching-learning effective in higher institutions of learning in Alappuzha, the following recommendations can be made for future actions in both areas of teaching and learning in higher institutions of learning: Plan for transformation and for ICT Support, Education should be free from political factors, Include new competencies in the curricula and in assessment schemes, Implementing new forms of continuous professional development in a workplace environment and as part of a culture of lifelong and peer learning, Building up a clear political will and invest in ICT consolidation, More ICT tools should be provided to each higher institution, Motivation and rewarding teachers to use ICT, Integrating the ICT strategy into the institution's overall strategies, and Transformation of positive attitudes towards ICT into efficient widespread practice.

To summarize, enabling ICT in education, and making use of technology in education creates an easy-to-manage learning environment where the delivery of information is so much smoother and the learning easier. *Also, ICT is definitely the path to take for institutions, especially in countries like ours, as our growth is directly aligned with technology and the field of education is no exception. And assuring higher quality education for its students will define whether the institution should move forward or perish.*

### References

Abtahi, M. S., &Hamidi, N. (2011). The importance of ict in educational system and curriculum. in *inted2011 Proceedings* (pp. 2853-2865). IATED.

Daniel, J. S. (2001). Using ICT for quality teaching, learning and effective management. UNESCO Asia and Pacific Regional Bureau for Education. Mbodila, Munienge, Telisa Jones, and KikungaMuhandji. "Integration of ICT in education: Key challenges." *International Journal of Emerging Technology and Advanced Engineering* 3.11 (2013): 515-520. <http://ictcurriculum.gov.in/?redirect=0>

Bottino, R. M. (2004). The evolution of ICT-based learning environments: which perspectives for the school of the future?. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 35(5), 553-567.

Are Indian Schools digital ready? –Page 10, Feb 15, 2017

Digital Learning – Page 10, Jan 12, 2018

**Dr Babu Rajan P. P**

Assistant Professor of English  
Sree Sankaracharya University of Sanskrit, Kalady

## **Spectacle Galore**

*Spectacle is a periodising term used by the French thinker, Guy Debord. Debord declared in his *The Society of the Spectacle* that the image is the final form of ideology. Around then as novel *Immortality* says imagology defeated all ideologies. The prime mover of the society is not production of things but the production of the images in the era of late capitalism, designated so, for some time. The appearance of the things matters rather than the thing itself. But for Debord rather than human vanity image consciousness is what we are condemned in a society which has substituted the spectacle for God. This is how Milan Kundera in his novel *Immortality* describes the situation: "All ideologies have been defeated: in the end their dogmas were unmasked as illusions and people stopped taking them seriously" (27). This is a celebratory and conformist postmodern stand, no doubt. Analysis apart, any way he continues presenting the situation clearly:*

Shorter Oxford English Dictionary says, spectacle has actually come from Latin *spectaculam* meaning public show. It could be first, an organized display or entertainment, especially one on a large and splendid scale or splendid display or ceremony. In this sense spectacle is very often connected with the TV and the virtual. The example the dictionary provides shows its relation to virtual reality and high capitalism: "The million dollar spectacle, with highly paid comedians and singers." Secondly it also means a person or thing as an object of public curiosity, contempt or admiration. Now this latter meaning is mainly used in the idiom "make a spectacle of oneself" (SOED 2945). Spectacle implies an organization of appearances that are simultaneously enticing, deceptive, distracting, and superficial, and this overlapping of functions supported theories on the symmetrical functioning of spectacle and ideology as well (Bennet 335).

Performativity is a concept which has close allegiance to the theory of spectacle. As Richard Schechner says performativity is ubiquitous, in daily life, in the arts, in the professions and in language. The words performative and performativity have acquired a wide range of meanings. Sometimes they are used precisely, but often they are used loosely to indicate something that is "like a performance" without actually being a performance in the conventional or formal sense. Schechner studied performativity in performance studies using J L Austin's theory of performativity and says "Performativity" is an even broader term, covering a whole panoply of possibilities opened up by a world in which differences are collapsing, separating media from live events, originals from digital or biological clones, and performing onstage from performing in ordinary life"(Schechner123). In this sense it becomes something like the entire world is a stage and all the men and woman merely

players, as it appeared contextually in Shakespeare centuries back. Does spectacularity matters? Or is only spectacularity that matters? This paper tries to interrogate whether this has become a central paradigm of the contemporary zeitgeist, especially in India, and if so its aftermath.

Just consider this: in Kerala we have uniforms for children in schools as elsewhere. This imposition of uniformity may have some functionalist value in education but what about groups of people willingly wearing uniform dress on special occasions? This is nothing new in Kerala, be it a wedding, an anniversary or any other function for that matter, in schools or anywhere else. No one really cares about this arbitrary market driven homogenization at the cost of diversity, enormous financial stress to the underprivileged, and wastefulness. No doubt this is fostered by the market and by the television culture in Kerala. Now the media influence has gone far beyond the influence of just television alone. Anjum the transgender heroine asks Saddam in *The Ministry of Utmost Happiness*: “Do you make all your life’s big decisions based on mobile phone videos? That’s how it is these days, yaar (sic). The world is only videos now” (Roy 407).

During the time of 2019Parliament election the Chief Electoral Officer of Kerala met with disapprobation, particularly from a former Bihar Chief Electoral Officer, a retired IAS official, and a significant Malayalam writer N S Madhavan, after an image controversy. This was for the unprecedented and unethical use of the photo of the Chief Electoral Officer in posters related to voter awareness campaign. According to Madhavan Chief Election Commissioner’s action was inappropriate and devaluing the official position. One High Court lawyer even moved Chief Election Commission asking to recover the money from Chief Electoral Officer saying that he even violated Supreme Court directions and Central Civil services conduct rules.

Recently two other curious events, from an imagology point of view, happened in Kerala cultural scene. First, a literary theft; of a poem by a Dalit poet by another writer-cum-academic and publishing of it, posing it as the latter’s own and later apologizing for it. The plagiarizer herself said this was given to her by a friend claiming the poem to be his own and asking her to publish it in her name as a mark of his adoration for her. The paradox about this is that if one thinks that the plagiarizer was ashamed, it is for us to be ashamed, she in fact used this opportunity for image boost. This created a lot of sensation in Kerala. Second, is that of an academic presently working in a university in northern Kerala cheating a major Malayalam newspaper and its readers in 2015 by giving a false news report and a photograph showing that he had won a research writing award instituted by a publication firm, with a photo in which Amitab Bachan, the iconic Hollywood film star, hands over the award to him. The photograph, in fact was a doctored one, in which a Telugu actor, Mahesh Babu was felicitated by Amitab Bachan, with Nandi award. The

original picture and the morphed image were later widely shared in social media and the newspaper itself carried the news of its having been cheated. A Columbia Professor delivered a talk in the earlier mentioned university. Interestingly, this publicity fraud came to spotlight as part of a feud between two academics to have a finger in the pie. That is this became public again ultimately as part of an image stunt. In these two incidents the fights took place primarily over Face book and WhatsApp. If Jonathan Swift's battle was fought in the space of a library these two battles were fought primarily over Face book and WhatsApp. The only thing is that while in Swift' imaginary battle was between the ancients and the moderns this battle was between the postmoderns over the postmodern virtual space. Austin reasoned that performatives uttered under false circumstances were unhappy (Schechner124).

Consider news from Kerala: Kerala Police recently came in for criticism as "moral policing," -- social media trolls basically-- for posting an advisory on extravagant pre-wedding photo shoots. Whether it's good for police to act in the role of teaching morality aside; the thing is that extravagant photo shoots have become a new cultural development of Kerala yuppies, as reported from elsewhere in India. "Save the date, but the society, including children are watching you" so cautioned the police on the Face book page. "The rise of India's viral wedding photo shoots," BBC thus reported the matter on 23 July 2019. "It will take one day and costs one lakh rupees (about \$ 1500)" "Our marriage is only about ten to fifteen minutes. So the only thing that lives are photos" says the male partner involved in the shoot from Kerala that BBC spotlights. BBC says "Extravagant shoots like this are increasingly popular in India as couples try to capture people's imagination on social media" (George). *The Hindu* reported in August 2019 that the Social Forestry Department officials arrested a bridegroom and four others for allegedly misusing a captive elephant and endangering public safety for a wedding photo session.

An interesting scandal occurred in North Kerala recently. In a first of its kind, ever reported from Kerala three government higher secondary teachers including the principal are facing criminal charges after getting suspended from their jobs for completely rewriting the answer scripts of two students and for rectifying those of thirty-two students. The teachers' argument for this organized impersonation was to achieve cent percent pass for the school.

Cheating is not new, but cheating for the image may be relatively new. How are we to understand this? Is this desire for fame and self projection making people crazy? Have we reached a tipping point in alienation? It has been observed that capitalism is now more interested in controlling our subjectivities and our mentalities. Is this our complete conformity to the capitalist unconscious? How does this impinge upon the pressing problem of

our times, climate change? It is not enough that you do something but you have to declare that you have done it, so do, it seems, the modern bureaucratic societies demand. This rule rules the roost in contemporary Indian education, leave alone higher education. For instance, the mass cheating in a school referred to above is the fallout of this rat race for performance. What if then the doing itself is done away with and is replaced by the declaration? Does this pose an even greater challenge to the already beleaguered Humanities?

Alienation in modernity is an important theme in philosophy at least from Hegel onwards. "Alienation (or estrangement) means, for Marx, that [hu]man does not experience [one]self as the acting agent in his grasp of the world, but that the world (nature, others, and he himself) remain alien to him. They stand above and against him as objects, even though they may be objects of his own creation. Alienation is essentially experiencing the world and oneself passively, receptively, as the subject separated from the object" (Fromm 39). For Marx this alienated [hu]man is not only alienated from others; he is alienated from the essence of humanity, from his "species-being," both in his natural and spiritual qualities. This alienation from the human essence leads to an existential egotism, described by Marx as "human essence becoming 'a means for his individual existence. It alienated from human his own body, external nature, his mental life and; his human life' " (Fromm 45). No wonder the concept of alienation found its first expression in Western thought in the Biblical concept of idolatry (Fromm 39).

Slavoj Zizek links this modern alienation to hyper-connectedness of humans. For him it could be said that the typical World Wide Web surfer today, sitting alone in front of a PC screen, is increasingly a monad with no direct windows on to reality, encountering only simulacra, and yet immersed more than ever in a global communication network (Zizek 34). Anita Dube the Curator of Kochi Muziris Biennale 2018, rightly identified this paradoxically alienating virtual hyper-connectedness (disenchantment after far removed from an organic world) and addressed her curatorial adventure to the "possibilities for a non-alienated life."

How can we understand a WhatsApp status where a young academic sitting on the lap of her lover with caption "In the mood of love" other than saying that life has become for so many people nothing other than vulgar exhibitionism. Or are we to understand that she has lost the capacity to be in a mood of love for ever, and compensating this loss through a virtualization of the reality. For Austin by extension all performatives uttered in theatre were unhappy (Schechner124). By the mid-1960s Debord formulated one of his main theses: "the more the spectator contemplates, the less he lives; the more readily he recognizes his own needs in the images of need proposed by the dominant system, the less he understands his own existence and desires" (Bennet 335).

Let us conclude by looking at a banality which we are all familiar with in varying degrees. The scene is in a restaurant at which Anjum, the heroine in *The Ministry of Utmost Happiness* stared in frank amazement. It is a family of four, an older couple and a younger one: The women, clearly mother and daughter, were both dressed alike in sleeveless printed tops and trousers, their faces caked with make-up. The young man, presumably the girl's fiancé, had his elbows on the table and frequently gazed down admiringly at his own (huge) biceps that bulged out of his blue, short-sleeved T-shirt. Only the older man did not appear to be enjoying himself. He peered furtively out from around the imaginary pillar he was hiding behind. Every few minutes the family suspended all conversation, immobilized their smiles and took selfies – with the menu, with the waiter, with the food and with each other. After each selfie they passed their phones around for others to see. They did not pay attention to anyone else in the restaurant (*Utmost Happiness* 441).

### References

- Bennet, Tony. Lawrence Grossberg, and Meaghan Morris. Editors. *New Key Words: A Revised Vocabulary of Culture and Society*. Blackwell, 2005
- Debord, Guy. *The Society of the Spectacle*. Zone Books, 1994.
- George, Anubha, et al., Eds. "The Rise of India's Viral Wedding Photo Shoots." Video. BBC <https://www.bbc.com/news/av/world-asia-india-49071912/the-rise-of-india-s-viral-wedding-photoshoots>. 23 Jul 2019.
- Fromm, Erich. *Marx's Concept of Man*. Bloomsbury, 2018.
- Kundera, Milan. *Immortality*. Tr. Peter Kussi. Faber, 1991.
- Roy, Arundhati. *The Ministry of Utmost Happiness*. Penguin, 2017.
- Schechner, Richard. *Media editor – Sara Brady. Performance Studies: An Introduction*. Third ed. Routledge, 2013.
- Shorter Oxford English Dictionary*. Sixth edition. Oxford UP, 2010.
- Zizek, Slavoj. *Violence: Six Sideways Reflections*. Picador, 2008.

**Dr Savithri A.**

Assistant Professor in Philosophy  
University of Calicut

**The Problem of Truth  
in Indian Knowledge Analysis**

*It is easy to see that one of the most important problems of the theory of knowledge is centered on the concept of truth. It may be defined as the distinguishing property of those propositions that harmonize with reality, specifying what the case is in fact. It is generally accepted that the aim of science is to find out which of the propositions in its domain are true. It means that, the scientists aim is to discover which propositions possess the peculiar quality of truth. At the same time, the central philosophical concern with truth is to discover the nature of that peculiar quality. Thus, the philosophical question of truth is concerned with the problem "what is truth", and, "what is meant by saying that it is a true proposition rather than merely saying a proposition"? However, the importance of this question arises from the deepness and diversity of the doctrines in which the concept of truth is deployed. We are tempted to think that true beliefs are useful, that the meaning of a sentence is given by the conditions that would render it true etc. For example, we believe that truth is the proper aim and the natural result of scientific inquiry and that valid reasoning maintains the truth. Therefore, insofar as we wish to understand, assess and clarify the epistemological view points, some account of the nature of truth would seem to be required.*

Truth is regarded as one of the key philosophical conceptions, perhaps the central one. As a central notion, many other important philosophical concepts like, thought, belief, knowledge, reality, existence or being, fact, possibility, necessity, etc... depend upon or are closely tied on to it. As far as belief is concerned, for definite, to believe is to believe that it is true. Similarly, for knowledge, if one knows a proposition, then it is true. When we consider reality, it is what our true statements represent and theories are about. By existence or being, we cannot talk truly about nonexistence, and by facts, they are what make our statements true. Possibility and necessity suggest that, one cannot say something *true* about what is merely possible. We can also see that over and above these concepts there are many other kindred notions such as propositions, sentence or statements, assertions, entailment and so on that depend on the concept of truth. Concept of truth is also central because it seems to be what theoretical life is about or what it aims at.

Knowledge contains the truth of what is said to be known, therefore, an entire account of knowledge must involve an account of truth. First of all, it is important to distinguish between truth and verification, which are considered as the nerve of the notion of truth. Therefore, one can ask questions like, what it is for something to be true and how it may be verified as true, how we may come to know that it is true, etc. Secondly, one has to necessarily distinguish these types of questions from the traditional question, under what conditions something may be known for certain as true? This traditional question is also



concerned with the search for the certainty. At times, the question ‘what is the truth?’ may be a request for information. It is either about what is said when something is asserted as true, or about the conditions under which it may rightly be so asserted as distinct from the conditions under which it may be known as such. A.J Ayer has claimed that the question of the conditions under which something may be asserted as true is comparatively easy to deal with, and that the main and most interesting questions are really about verification.

In common parlance all kinds of things can be said to be true from beliefs to persons. But for the present purpose it would suffice to address issues related to truth when truth is attributed to beliefs and what beliefs are expressed in the forms of statements. In fact, an account of the conditions of truth can be given in terms of the conditions under which a statement can be said to be true. Here, the account of the conditions of truth can be employed with some alteration of details. Sometimes it has been viewed that the same kind of truth cannot be done for persons, because often truth is used in a derivative or inferential sense. Also there is a general consensus that truth and falsity should not be attributed at all to sentences, despite the views of some philosophers asserting on the matter.<sup>2</sup> As far as a sentence is concerned as a linguistic unit used to state something it cannot be considered as a candidate for truth. Alternatively, it is the statements to which truth and falsity are attributable, or, as already mentioned, to beliefs of which these statements may be the expressions.

Regarding the form of standard analysis of knowledge, there are two preliminary points to be noted. In its standard presentation on analysis there is a statement in the form of ‘A knows that  $p$ ’ in terms of the truth conditions. First, it asserts that ‘A knows that  $p$ ’ is true only when the more complex statement ‘A believes that  $p$ , and A has sufficient reason for the belief, and ‘ $p$  is true’ is also true. Such analyses of truth condition have been well supported by the philosophers, especially, by the empiricists. Secondly, it is a terminological one, the standard analysis offers a set of necessary and sufficient conditions for the truth of ‘A knows that  $p$ ’. For example, one can say that X is a sufficient condition for y is to say that if X is the case then y must be the case, and if the former is true then the latter must be the same. In the standard analysis ‘A knows that  $p$ ’ is a sufficient condition for ‘A believes that  $p$ ’. Y’s being a necessary condition of x is the converse relation. Thus, ‘A believes that  $p$ ’ is a necessary condition for the truth of ‘A knows that  $p$ ’. In effect, the standard analysis identifies the conditions which are individually necessary and jointly sufficient for the truth of ‘A knows that  $p$ ’.

It is considered that the statements can be true in various kinds of methods and it is necessary to decide which of them attends the meaning of the analysis of truth condition. Perhaps the simplest way of showing the word ‘truth’ is to reveal that it is liable to interpret in many ways. To answer the question such

as, what do we mean by the terms ‘truth’ and ‘falsehood’, the truth conditions are useful. These conditions are really composed by the nature of the concepts that we are trying to illustrate. They are as following:

The version which we give must permit for the possibility of falsehood and error. Truth and falsehood must be properties of something in a world of conscious being since a world without consciousness would have no place for truth or error. Obviously, the candidates for the predicate true and false under this condition would be beliefs or their expressions that are put in language. One can call such entities as *truthbearers*.

Such truth bearers exist not simply by virtue of their own properties but must be true *in virtue* of their relation to something other than themselves. If a belief or a statement is true at a particular time, it is true once and for all. There cannot make any change in its truth value in the course of time. These conditions are just attempts to clarify and make accurate the concepts which we are trying to analyze.

It is important to mention here, about the relativistic nature of truth. Almost all philosophers widely agree that the rational belief can be relative in nature. Relativism is used in the sense that one person in one situation can rationally believe what would be irrational for another person in a different situation. The reason is that, one person may have evidence to support a belief while another person lacks evidence for that same belief. On this account, the first person could justifiably believe what the second person may not justifiably believe. Thus, the belief is *justified for person A* while it is *unjustified for person B*, but this is not the same as saying that a belief is *true for A* while being *false for B*.

According to the relativists conception of truth, the standards that one uses for determining, or *identifying*, what is true actually constitute what it is to be true.<sup>4</sup> On the one hand, we can stipulate the conditions for what it is to be true, i.e., what are the defining conditions under which a belief or a statement is true. On the other hand, we can argue about the methods a person should employ for discerning or identifying the beliefs or statements that are true. These are the methods, or rules, one should use for trying to find out the beliefs and statements that satisfy the defining conditions for being true.

When we consider the relativists theory of truth, it is good that we identify the difference between defining conditions of truth and conditions for identification of truth. For example, in different situations, two people can use the same methods for recognizing the truth and get various results concerning the same statement. In this situation, one of them can identify the statement as true while the other identifies the same statement as false, even though the available evidences vary according to their different determinations.

Yet, their different determinations can be accounted for in terms of their different situations. If the methods which are used by these two people in identifying what is true also serve as conditions of what *is* true, then the conclusion must be in the relativistic model. In that case, the statement under consideration not only is identified *astrue* by the first person, but also *is true* for that person, because the truth defining and truth identifying criteria are the same for statements.<sup>5</sup> Obviously, we should admit the possibility of differences between people in their determinations of what is true. That is, even if they are using the same standards for identifying what is true, there is possibility of differences among the people. Thus, there is undoubtedly true relativity in people's determinations of what is true. The rules for how properly we determine what is true also are the standards for what is true. These two different determinations lead to the conclusion that there is relativity about what is true.

While dealing with the relativism, we would face a serious dilemma arising from the simple question— Is the supposed truth of relativism about truth itself relative? That is, is it relative to the mere belief of some individual group or group of individuals?<sup>6</sup> If we infer that it is relative in that way, then the supposed truth of relativism would seem not to differ at all from the mere judgment of some individual or group of individuals. In another sense, if the truth of relativism is not relative in that way, then we have a supposed truth, namely, the truth of relativism. It is incompatible with the relativist assertion that all truth is relative to individuals or group of individuals. Confronted with this dilemma, relativism about truth shows that the problem is in deep trouble.

Truth in this relativistic conception might depend on some arguments quite different from those which we have considered. For instance, they might maintain the distinction between the standards for discerning the truth and the definition of truth. Besides, there is still the claim that the definition of what it is for a statement to be true depends in some way on facts relative to particular knowers. To explore this possibility further, we should examine some of the competing philosophical theories about what truth is.

The predicate 'true' can be applied to all types of items, which are abstract or at least non-concrete entities. They are thoughts, assertions, conceptions, views, theories and so on. There are two basic relations from which all the meanings of the qualifying word seem to obtain. The first one is known as truth- bearer, where 'true' is used as a *property* of an item that makes it genuine, natural or real as opposed to contrived artificial or fictional. The second one is, 'true' as a *relation* between some item to *which* the predicate is attributed, and some other item, which *makes true* the first item, the *truthmaker*. There is a long philosophical debate among the philosophers about fixing the real truth bearers, so to say.

The tradition going back to Descartes and classical empiricism asserts that the truth-bearers are ideas, beliefs or mental representations. According to them, the truth-bearers do carry certain content, but that tends to be mental or psychological in nature. Some philosophers have the opinion that the bearers of truth are sentences or physical symbols, or at least entities locatable in space and time, like utterances. However, philosophers of contemporary times have claimed that truth-bearers are propositions, the abstract entities expressed by linguistic sentences. A few philosophers hold that truth is an *intrinsic* or essential property of truth bearers, that is, one that they have absolutely and in virtue of nothing else, and not in relation to other things. For example, *being happy* is a monadic property, where as *being a brother* is relational one. Still, the most common view is that truth is relational property, which holds between truth bearers and other entities.

While speaking on truth we also need to talk about truth donors or truth makers. The most classical conception of truth is that it is a relation of correspondence between the true items and something else, the truth makers. There are differences of opinion about the nature of truth-makers or truth donors. While some philosophers claim that they are entities of a different kind from truth-bearers, namely facts, states of affairs or situations in the world, some others do not make such a distinction and holds that truth is correspondence with reality as such. A distinct, relational conception of truth holds that truth is a relation between the truth-bearers themselves. This sort of conception is known as the coherence conception of truth. According to this kind of conception, there is no need to appeal to truth-makers as some further entities and to a relation distinct from the one that holds between the truth-bearers. Yet another view, namely, pragmatism, holds that truth relates to the useful effects of our conceptions. Let us explain these classical theories of truth individually, step by step.

The most frequent answer towards the question of the nature of the truth in the history of philosophy is the correspondence theory. It says that a proposition is true *if and only if* it corresponds to reality or corresponds to fact. The mental incitement behind this correspondence theory of truth is the idea that the truth of what we say or think depends upon what the world is and does not depend upon what we happen to believe. P.K. Moser says that, according to a longstanding tradition about what it is for statement to be true, there must be some appropriate correspondence between true statements and actual features of the world.<sup>7</sup> It means that, what we think is true or false depends upon whether or not there is something in the world that answers to it. When we say that a true statement is that which corresponds to the fact, we have first to determine the nature of truth-bearers and truth donors, the two entities we have discussed ahead. Indeed, we must give a clear account of the nature of the relation of correspondence which links the *truth bearer* to the truth donor. However, the basic intuition of the correspondence theory of truth is based on

the belief that there is an external, mind-independent world and truths of the world are objectively accessible. In this sense, the truths of the world are concerned with how the world is and what the facts of the world are. In other words, a *truth bearer* is true *iff* it corresponds to a state of affairs and the state of affairs obtains. For example, suppose, there is a grassland before one and it is not a matter of his state of mind. Regardless of whether we believe it or not, it seems to be an objective matter independent of anyone's mind and the grass seems to be present irrespective of it being perceived or not. In fact, whether our belief is true or not is determined by whether the land is actually there or not. Thus, the truth of such observational beliefs depends on external reality, which does not in turn depend on what we believe.

To sum up, the basic assumption of correspondence intuition is that the truth of our belief is not mind-dependent, that is, it is independent of our mind. If truth is not mind-dependent and is at least in that sense objective, then we have a version of *realism*. In other words, the external things are as they are independently of how we take them to be. In terms of correspondence when we think of true propositions, whether believed or not, it is usually added that they are true in virtue of the correspondence with the external world. The basic principle of correspondence theory of truth is that true propositions correspond with reality. Thus, the proposition that there is a glass before a person is true provided in reality there is a glass before him, and it might also be said that it is true in virtue of there really being such a glass. More readily, it should be thought as a placeholder which any given correspondence theory would replace with some particular correspondence theorist. And also it would vary depending on their choice of *truth-bearer*. If the truth bearer is belief then the relation would be something like, 'is a belief that'. It means that, a belief is true provided there exist a fact corresponding to it. In brief, in order to provide a complete theory of truth, we need to explicate what it is for a belief to correspond to a fact.

A version of correspondence theory called identity theory holds that we cannot draw a watertight compartment between truth bearers and truth donors. This holistic perspective maintains that though in every truth element there are two things—the bearer of truth and that which in the world is responsible for its being true, to which it corresponds or the truth donor, a range of vision of truth put forward in this holistic perspective denies any kind of duality. The correspondence theory says that when a proposition is true, it is identical with a realized state of affairs. This nature of identity theory of truth preserves realism and its metaphysical position that lies behind the correspondence theory, i.e., *what there is* determines whether or not a proposition is true. Further, the identity theory allows for a certain relation of correspondence that happens between my belief and the state of affairs. Now, we should remember that the propositions which we express are delivered through sentence tokens, mental representations, pictures and images, and the like, in other words, by

means of different vehicles. On this account, we can say that the vehicle is itself true or false derivatively, as the proposition it is used to express is true or false. Thus, the identity theory may be understood not only as a particular version of the correspondence theory but also as a particular way of understanding the nature of the correspondence.

Thus, the correspondence theory assumes that discovering the truth or falsity of a proposition mainly involves comparing it directly with the facts or reality. Here, the problem with this definition is that we have no knowledge of reality as such, only of the conceptualized accounts of it for which our intellect is, at least in part, responsible. To be compared with our judgments or propositions, the facts are not 'out there', but exist in the same realm as propositions. Actually they are propositional in nature, and what looks to the correspondence theorist to be correspondence between propositions on the one hand and the facts are simply correspondence between propositions and propositions. Therefore, the value of truth of the proposition is an assessment of consistency between propositions. Thus coherency theory emerges with the criticism of correspondence theory.

There are different alternatives to the correspondence theory of truth down the tradition. Perhaps the most widely known alternative is the coherence theory of truth. The common nature of the coherence theory holds that a proposition is true *if and only if* it is a member of a coherent set. When we assert that the beliefs of a given individual are true to the extent that the set of all their beliefs is coherent, rather than its relation to reality, this kind of theories make the truth a matter of a *truth bearer's* relation to other *truth bearers*. This means that for each belief  $x$ ,  $x$  is considered as true *iff*  $x$  is a member of a coherent set. Among the coherent set of beliefs, each of them entails each other and thereby gives a complete picture of the world. In brief, a thought, or a belief or a proposition is true if and only if it belongs to a coherent set of propositions mutually implying each other, and together provide a consistent picture of reality, for eg.,  $x$  is true *iff*  $x$  belongs to a coherent set  $S$ .

Major criticisms raised against coherentism have shown that truth cannot merely be defined in terms of the coherence among the members of the set under dispute. For as we know, however tight we may claim the coherence is among the members of the set ( any relation short of logical ), it remains relative as we can have a more coherent set conceived in future. Also, there might be occasions where a system becomes more coherent by adding a few false propositions. And what more, there can be rival and divergent belief systems that are all internally coherent. However, it is a matter of fact that coherence theories cohabit with anti-realist ontology. If we consider the reality itself as a system of mental entities, then even the true thoughts cannot correspond to some other reality, since there is no other. On this account, it would be spontaneous to assume that the truth of a true thought must consist in

its relation to other thoughts. And there would be a true system of beliefs in which everything that is real and possible is coherently included. According to them, there is no perfectly or completely independent sense of 'truth' which is available to us. In place of it what we have are truths in a web, which are in different sorts of relation with each other. And what we accept as true are those that cohere with other true propositions.

There are many important difficulties in determining what justified propositions are relevant to the truth of another proposition which is true in virtue of the coherence with them. There is a plausible example we can have from the realm of perception, that how truth can be based on coherence of a proposition, if one is perceptually justified in believing in it. It says that if there is a palm tree before him, which coheres with what one justifiably believe on the basis of memory, introspection, inference and so on as well as with what he or others would be justified in believing in these ways, this proposition would be regarded as true in virtue of coherence with others. In contrast, it may be considered as false and would be called as incoherent with certain other propositions if one fails to have a visual impression of a tree in the relevant place. One can see that the major objection to the coherence theory in general is the possibility of more than one system of proposition which cohere in the manner required. In fact, there is yet another objection to coherence theory, which coherence theory of truth is inseparably wound up with a particular theory of knowledge. Although the coherence theorists are not sure about the meaning of truth and its definition, they do provide a criteria for determining a statement as true, i.e., verifying a statement as true or false. In other words, they have confused the meaning of truth with the criteria of true statements. The same is expressed by Keith Lehrer in a clear and lucid manner "...the coherence theory has often been a disguised form of a theory of how we determine that a sentence is true or justified, the claim to know that it is true. The epistemological theory... maintains that claims to know that a sentence is true are justified not by appeal to observation but by appeal to other sentences with which the sentence in question coheres. As such the coherence theory is not a theory of truth at all, but a theory of justification".

The critics of the coherence theory point out that the truth of a proposition is simply not entirely consumed by our coherent beliefs or potential beliefs supporting that proposition even when they are justified. To put it in another way, it is to say that truth is not a construct out of evidence, even excellent evidence that produce a coherent body of beliefs. We can better understand this point if we consider a related theory of truth, namely, Pragmatism.

The third theory of truth is the pragmatic theory which has established itself as the major rival to correspondence and coherence theory. When we try to understand the conception of correspondence means, we seem thrown back on some kind of coherence. Suppose, we say that the proposition 'the tree is

green' corresponds with its reality: In testing this proposition, by examining the tree in good light, one will always get confirming results. It appears that there is little more than saying and testing the proposition. That is, we seem to discover propositions that cohere well with the original one. But moving ahead, what matters when we accept or reject certain propositions is a question that takes us to a different direction. Such a kind of vision has led some philosophers to go further and hold a pragmatic theory of truth. According to them, the pragmatic theory is on according to which true propositions are simply those that 'work', in the sense that they are successful ones in practice or pragmatically. What thus comes to us is this: believing them, acting on them, and otherwise confirming them, leads to positive results, such as spectrographic confirmation of the tree's colour.<sup>10</sup>

In pragmatic theory, the truth of something depends on what it can achieve in practice on the basis of the claims of that truth. On the one hand, the pragmatic theory considers that a true proposition is one which would be endorsed unanimously by all persons. The persons had an adequate relevant experience to judge it. On the other hand, a proposition is ascribed as true *if and only if* it produces beneficial results for the believers. Behaviors based on a belief in the proposition will lead us to such long run results. Thus, for the pragmatic theorists a proposition is true *if* it is useful to believe it that is useful to the prospective believers.

The pragmatists define truth of a belief in terms of its utility or of its beneficial consequences for action. Regarding this nature of truth, there are many beliefs that are useful, but false, and vice versa. They emphasize that truth is a certain type of validation or verification that ideas receive when they are put to use in our interacting with the world. In addition, this theory has an aura of subjectivism or relativism. It holds that what is useful for *S* might not be useful to *T*, and truth at least depends upon our desires and goals which are not obviously reduced to a single one, and are based on the circumstances. Worse as B. Russell remarks, pragmatism, so understood completely misrepresents the concept of knowledge: to know that *p* is to know that *p* is true, not to know that *p* is useful.<sup>11</sup> Note that William James the major proponent of Pragmatism, wanted to locate the meaning and importance of truth in our intellectual life, and to attract attention to how much purely intellectual ideas are connected to practical ideas, to emotional life and to action in general.<sup>12</sup> But, further it becomes unclear how pragmatism offers a definition of truth at all, other than some reflections on the point of an idea of truth.

When conjoined with the pragmatic theory of meaning, the pragmatic theory of truth may be more probable. For instance, if one says the proposition that 'Heaven exists', then the meaning of 'Heaven exists' is equated with the practical difference that the belief in Heaven makes to the believer's life. According to the truth of the belief, more than the theoretical problem of the



nature of truth, there are issues with regard to the matter of its practical problem of arriving at and testing what seems to be true. As a result they reduced the idea of being true to that of being accepted as true or being tested for truth. The various standards of consistency, expediency, satisfaction etc... are really cases for accepting something as true rather than part of the meaning as true. In brief, the pragmatic theorist made truth as subjective while it is objective par excellence.

As already mentioned, the pragmatic definition of truth can be regarded as relativistic in nature. The reason for it is that the relevant sort of the description of truth can differ from person to person and from culture to culture. Whenever a person considers a special belief as something that proves useful for him it may not be useful for another person. It is clear that, it is true relative to the first person but false relative to the second person. One person may find it useful, even cognitively useful relative to his background beliefs, that is, his psychological attitudes that determine his physical condition, another person may not find this useful to believe. Thus, given pragmatism, truth will vary accordingly. One will be inclined to reject the pragmatic theory of truth, when one opposes a defining relation between truth and something apparently relative and variable as cognitive usefulness.

Moreover, the pragmatists have not said sufficiently about the accurate nature of the type of *usefulness* they claim to be definitive of truth. Some of the pragmatics holds that, the conception of truth seems to be just the notion of epistemic warrant or justification. Still, some others say that, one can admit the importance of considerations of cognitive usefulness for the *justification* of a belief. But a few other thinkers deny that such usefulness is definitive of *truth* if the notion of justification happens to be central for truth as in the coherence and pragmatic theories of truth. It seems that on any particular conception of usefulness that pragmatists have offered, it is possible for a belief to qualify as useful but still be false. For some false beliefs can, of course, prove to be cognitively useful. However, the pragmatists rely on the strong intuition that a statement *cannot* be cognitively useful and still fail to be true.

The correspondence, coherence and pragmatic theories of truth import to offer what are in some sense the standards of truth. They claim respectively that the standards of truth are correspondence with fact, coherence with other propositions or judgments and success in practice. Here, success in practice means leading to successful results, which may take the form of successful predictions obviously of more practical kind. It is far from obvious that these theories could be taken as theories about what truth means. All these theories propose that we should look for further reasons why the theories were put forward, for further intentions on the part of the proponents. D.W. Hamlyn, in his *Theory of Knowledge*, argues that, what is important about most of the expositions of the classical theories of truth is that they are part and parcel of

the classical theory of knowledge, the search for certainty. According to him, this is less true of the pragmatic theory, which is concerned with something less than absolute certainty and advocates a content of what works in practice. What is important for us to note is that praxis as a theory arose by way of reaction against the classical theories of knowledge and is therefore imbued with the same spirit as with the rest.

Thus, it is clear that these traditional classical theories of truth cannot be taken as theories about what truth means. One of the mistakes they have committed is that they identified truth conditions with verification conditions. There are only a few clearly uncontroversial facts about truth like, the proposition that 'Snow is white is true *iff* snow is white', the proposition that 'Lying is wrong is true *iff* lying is wrong', and so on. Traditional theories of truth acknowledge this fact but regard it as insufficient. They inflate their theories with some further doctrines of the form 'Y is true *iff* Y has the property *p*', where the property *p* may refer to like, corresponding to reality, verifiability, or being suitable as a basis for action, which is supposed to specify what is truth. A collection of original alternatives to the classical theories result from denying the need for any such additional specification. For instance, one might suppose that the fundamental theory of truth contains nothing more than equivalences of the form, '*p* is true *iff* *p*'.

Apart from the so called classical theories of truth, there are modern deflationary theories of truth such as, redundancy, performative, minimalist and other such theories of truth that may better be described as theories of truth ascriptions, for they are in fact theories of utterances and not theories explicating what truth is. For example, one can make an utterance like, 'The English editors are elegant people is true'. The surface grammar of such utterances proposes that we use them to assert a particular quality, i.e., truth of sentences or propositions. But many of the deflationary theorists deny this and in fact, they all ratify that the deflationary theories do not contain any such property as truth. Thus, according to them, there is no requirement for, or sense to, a theory of truth different from a theory of truth ascriptions. According to deflationary theorists, the classical theories of truth, such as correspondence, coherence and praxis, are not wrong. Indeed, they are something worse, for the classical theories are wrong-headed from the beginning. In fact, they are attempting to analyze something which simply does not exist. Accordingly, the deflationary theories are best exhibited in connection with an account of the reason de'tre of our conception of truth. Yet, its function is not to give an account of propositions, as one might naturally infer from its syntactic form, but rather to enable us to build a certain kind of generalization. This is visible in the following example: 'What Einstein said is true' is immediately synonymous with the infinite conjunction, like, say the following: 'If Einstein said that nothing goes faster than light, then nothing goes faster than light' and 'if Einstein said that nuclear weapons should never be built, then nuclear

weapons should never be built'... and so on. But we cannot capture this statement without a truth predicate. Moreover, the deflationist argues that all proper uses of the truth predicate, including those in science, logic, semantics and metaphysics, are merely display of this generalizing function. And, that the equivalence plan is just what is needed to explain that function.

In his influential paper "The Foundation of Mathematics", published in 1927, F.P. Ramsey outlined an account of truth, which has offered a basis for a strong alternative to more traditional approaches. According to him, it is evident that, for example, 'It is true that Caesar was murdered' means no more than that Caesar was murdered, and 'It is false that Caesar was not murdered' means that Caesar was not murdered. Here, the fact is that when we add the predicates 'is true' or 'is false' to sentences, it does not provide more information other than what is already asserted. Therefore, we are not *describing* the sentences by these predicates. According to Ramsey, supposing that there is a separate problem of truth originates from a linguistic muddle'.<sup>16</sup> It is called a linguistic muddle because we are misunderstanding the function of phrases like 'is true' and 'is false'. Even if they have the grammatical order of predicates like 'is yellow' or 'is hot' which do describe their subjects and also communicate information predicates like 'is true' and 'is false' are no more than 'phrases that we sometimes use for emphasis or for stylistic reasons'. On this account the appropriate use of 'is true' and 'is false' may be compared to the use of adverbs like 'certainly', 'really', 'assuredly', and the like which serve no more purpose than to emphasis or reassert what is already stated. Thus, Ramsey concludes his notion of truth by saying that, if 'Caesar was murdered' 'is true' means any more than 'Caesar was murdered' it can mean, perhaps, 'Caesar really was murdered'.

This point of view of Ramsey is considered as more influential for many reasons. First of all, the difficulty of obtaining a transparent and affirmative or positive account of the nature of truth makes it tempting to suppose that we are seeking for something that does not exist. It is regarded as non-existing because 'true' and 'false' have only form of adjectives and were not adjectives in function and they have no descriptive content also. Secondly, this redundancy theory can be asserted from a logical point as well: it has been observed that the truth-value of any proposition,  $p$  is exactly the same as the truth-value of the proposition ' $p$  is true'. In the same way, the truth-values of  $p$  and ' $p$  is false' must be identical with whatever proposition we substitute for  $p$ .

We can see that there is an updated account of Ramsey's theory by P.F. Strawson which combines the assertion that 'true' and 'false' are not descriptive words with an explanation of what their proper function really is. According to him Ramsey was right in asserting that to say that a statement is true is not to make a further statement, but wrong in suggesting that to say that a statement is true is not to do something different from, or in addition to just

making the statement.<sup>19</sup> Another modern theorist Austin has shown how many words in natural languages have important ways of working other than, or in addition to, their descriptive functions. Austin successfully shows that linguistic performances like promising, say for example that 'I promise to lend you the money' are speech acts and have quite a different function to perform from what descriptive assertions do. In this context his use of the word 'promise' is itself the making of a promise. In fact, by saying 'I promise' he has actually made the promise. According to Austin, such uses of language are called performatory functions of language. Following Austin, Strawson further points out that, many uses of 'true' and 'false' are performatory in this way, or that they display similar language uses. He says that they may be used to make concessions or to reveal conviction or some other attitude. For example, 'That's true' may be a function as equivalent to 'I agree', or 'I grant you that point'. These are performatory uses of 'agree' or 'grant' and at the same time, there is a reference to the statement which is being agreed to or conceded.<sup>21</sup> It is well known that Strawson is agreeing with what Ramsey says about truth, but denying that it is the whole story. The decisive addition is the performatory or concessive element in the use of the word 'true' and, of course, there are analogous elements in the use of false.

From the above discussion about truth one can easily arrive at two main points. First, the phrase 'that's true' can be used in the performatory or concessive ways. This point may be questioned by asking, whether this is just a peculiarity of any language or is it a philosophical truth? The philosophers of language hold that if it is a truth of philosophy then it must hold on all languages. The second point is based on Strawson's claim that 'true' functions as an abbreviatory statement - device used to indicate our endorsement of an assertion: if we accept Strawson's view point, we cannot take ourselves to be saying that we endorse statements that seem to be *true* and reject those which seem to be *false*. In other words, while endorsing or rejecting any proposition, any rational person may raise the question why we endorse some statements and reject others. Such a question would bring us once again back to the 'problem of truth' as it has traditionally been conceived.

Now we can consider another theory of truth, namely, the semantic theory, which is classified under the category of modern theories of truth. The programs of semantic analysis are derived from Alfred Tarski's theory of truth, which is a sophisticated form of the correspondence theory. According to Tarski, truth is a relationship between words and things; it is one which is to be analyzed in terms of the two more primitive relationships of denotation and satisfaction. Denotation is that relationship which holds between names and the things they name. Satisfaction is the relationship between predicates and the things, or sequences of things, which satisfy them. They are in semantic relationships in the sense that they relate words to things. It is not a semantic question in the sense that it can be answered just by considering what the terms

involved mean, whether a given thing, or sequence of things, that satisfies a given predicate.

Through this kind of theory Tarski showed how to provide a definition for a language like first order predicate calculus, using only the primitive semantic concepts of denotation and satisfaction. Taking for granted these primitive concepts Tarski says that the terms of this language denote only real objects, and that its predicates are satisfied, only by such objects. It is true to say that the truth or falsity of any sentence of a language can be shown to depend on what real things, or sequences of such things satisfy its primitive predicates. As a result, if we had a language like this, we should have no difficulty in saying what would make its sentences true or false.

Tarski's theory of truth naturally leads to the question whether every instance of truth can be expressed in some language whose primitive terms denote only real entities, and whose primitive predicates are satisfied, if at all, only by such entities, or sequences of them. That is, *can every truth be expressed in a realistically interpretable extensional language?* It may be an important question, because if all truths can be expressed in such a language then truth is at least *extensionally* equivalent to a complex correspondence relationship. The Tarskian theory of language analysis specifies that a sentence of this type of language will be true *iff* it corresponds to a reality in the specified manner.<sup>23</sup> On the other hand, if there are truths which cannot be expressed in such a language, then we can construct truth theories for more elaborate kinds of languages which are adequate for the purpose. It means that either the correspondence theory of truth must be wrong, or there are primitive word-thing relationship besides denotation and satisfaction. For the requirement of any semantic analysis the language should be denoting or being satisfied by the real objects, because, it is not only that the language in which it is given be an extensional one, but also that the terms and predicates occurring in the analysis should be capable of being understood realistically. It should be reminded that if the requirements of realism have not been met by some proposed analysis, then the truth or falsity of the analyzed statement cannot be understood in terms of correspondence.

There remains the question how to conceive truth making use of the schematic idea 'p' is true iff 'p'? For example, one can answer to this question like the statement "Grass is green is true, *iff* grass is green".<sup>24</sup> We can argue that to say that something is true is equivalent to asserting it, and go on to hold that this equivalence is at least the main thing we need to understand about truth. This approach is associated with a minimalist conception of truth. The minimalist account of truth is roughly that there is no more to understanding in truth than understanding this equivalence. For instance, we know that to assert propositions people normally employ their understanding on what kinds of considerations can confirm or disconfirm the propositions. In very general

terms, we know that under what sorts of conditions make us agree or disagree with the propositions.

The present analysis shows that, the minimalist account is correct in the following manner: asserting the correspondence of true propositions with ‘reality’ or with ‘the facts’ is nothing more than asserting an equivalent scheme. One may think that to give such a minimalist reading of the correspondence view is to abandon it all together. Perhaps that is so, but it expresses a *kind* of correspondence of equivalence between calling a proposition true and asserting it.

In Indian philosophical parlance the three words such as *satyam*, *yatharthiyam* and *pramanyam* have been commonly used to convey the notion of truth. The word *satyam* is commonly used to convey the moral and metaphysical situations. The remaining two, namely, *yathartyam* and *pramanyam* have overwhelmingly associated with the logico-epistemic contexts. The metaphysical conception of truth as the Ultimate Reality will be touched upon in course of the discussion of the *Vedantic* theory of truth. But, the epistemic accounts of truth will remain incomplete without mentioning a few issues that may fall under the category of metaphysical. Here our attention will mainly focus on the epistemic conceptions for good reasons, which will soon be evident.

The Indian epistemologists in general hold that any adequate theory of truth is expected to raise and answer some questions like say, (1) What is it that can be said to be true or what kinds of entities can be truth-bearers? (2) What is the nature of truth, or how can be truth defined? or What do we mean when we say that a proposition (or whatever) is true? (3) Under what condition is a proposition (or whatever) true, and finally (4) What is the test of truth – that is, how can we ascertain whether a proposition (or whatever) is true?<sup>25</sup> While discussing theories of truth Indian philosophers have exhibited great vigor and acumen that kept-up our expectations. But they are not unanimous about their theories of truth. However, they have successfully segregated discussions on the nature of truth and the test of truth, for tackling them as distinct questions have some definite advantages. For example, they say that it is easier to find a criterion of applicability with regard to a concept than to define a concept, for, in spite of having differences with respect to the nature of a particular concept, it is possible to agree on a criterion.

There are some common presuppositions underlying Indian theories of truth. Among them, the first and foremost is related to the nature of *truth-bearer*. According to Indian philosophers what can be said to be true or false is neither a proposition, nor a statement, nor a sentence or belief, but is a non-recollective awareness that is episodic and cognitive in nature. In accordance with their diverse metaphysical commitments, different Indian philosophical

traditions hold cognition or *jnana* differently. According to the Nyaya Vaisesikas cognition is a quality (*guna*) of the self (*atman*), whereas to the mimamsakas it is an action (*kriya*) of the self. Some of the philosophers belonging to the Samkhya-Yoga or the Vedanta traditions regard cognition as a modification (*vritti*) of the inner sense (*antahkarana*). These ontologically divergent entities are designated by the same name, *jnana*, simply because these are all intentional occurrences about some object (*visaya*). Most of the above mentioned philosophical systems regard that the form (*akara*) of cognition is derived from its object, which is usually external. The one and only exception probably is that of Buddhist schools, in which a cognition is said to originate along with its own form.

A cognition, either true or false, is capable of relational (*Visistajnana*) and admits of constituent elements in the logical analysis. That is, for cognition to be true or false there must be a logical structure in the analysis. And the logical structure of a cognition always extends beyond its linguistic structure. Therefore, it is obvious that, in Indian philosophy a *truth-bearer* is neither identical with a sentence nor can be identified with a belief. According to them a truth-bearer is generally taken to be dispositional in nature. Moreover, Indian philosophers never felt the need for propositions, the abstract entities as the meaning of sentences. However, there may be an exception here, the Grammarian school seems to accept something like propositions, the abstract entities; but on a closer look it gets revealed that they too do not subscribe to any abstract entity like proposition. Strictly speaking, *sáabdarthas*, the meanings of words and sentences, to which the Grammarians are committed, are not abstract entities. However, there are what we call *sabdarthas* that form a third category over and above the linguistic items and their referents in their external world, but these entities do not inhabit any mysterious third realm.

J.N. Mohanty offers an analysis of Indian theories of truth wherein he points out some common tendencies in the divergent theories on truth available.<sup>26</sup> He starts by asking what does truth refer to, or what is it a property of? In the Western tradition, he identifies propositions as those entities which attach themselves with truth. For the Western philosophers, it is well known that propositions are accepted as real entities, as something existing outside language. The Indian philosophical tradition as opposed to the Western tradition holds that, cognition predicates truth. For Western philosophers a sentence is true if it expresses a true proposition whereas for Indian philosophers truth gets expressed in terms of true cognition, a real process related to the knower. But this cognitive process is not completely subjective in the sense that there is a logical structure of its own which one becomes aware of through reflection during the cognition. In some sense this structure is necessary, because it is this that makes the truth objective. Further Mohanty mentions that Indian philosophers had different ideas of *necessary truth* even if none of them are exactly similar to the Kantian idea of analytic truth.<sup>27</sup>

According to him the most important characteristic of truth is the fallible nature of truth, a position which is commonly held by most traditions. However, we may note that there is no empirical truth the opposite of which is inconceivable, and none that is indubitable. Mohanty says that given suitable epistemic conditions anything and everything can become the subject-matter of doubt and one can error about anything whatsoever.<sup>28</sup> However, it should be noted that this fallibilism is with respect to empirical truths only, moral truths have an associated infallibilism.<sup>29</sup>

In Indian philosophy true cognition is called *prama*, and its means (*karana*) is *pramana*. Indian philosophers have translated the conception of truth as *pramatva* or *pramanya*, and the theory of truth as *pramanyavada*. The term *pramanya* may also mean the property of being a *pramana*, that is, the causal condition which is immediately followed by a true cognition. That is, the word *pramanya* may either mean the property of being instrumental in bringing about true knowledge (*pramakaranatva*), or simply the truth of a knowledge (*pramatva*). Of these two, the first sense means that the *pramanya* belongs to the various instrumental causes of true knowledge whereas, the second sense means that, it characterizes knowledge itself, if that knowledge is true. According to Gangesa, of these two senses the second one is logically prior in as much as the very idea of being an instrumental cause of true knowledge cannot be understood without understanding what is meant by true knowledge and in effect without understanding what we understand by truth.

#### References

- Audi, Robert. *Epistemology – A Contemporary Introduction to The Theory of knowledge*. London: Routledge Publishers, 1995.
- Banerjee, N.V. *The Spirit of Indian Philosophy*. New Delhi: Arnold-Heinemann Publishers, Pvt. Ltd, 1974.
- Basu, Sandhya. *Justification, Concepts and Theories*. Kolkotta: Progressive Publishers, 37 A, 2003.
- Bhatt, Govardhan. P. *The Basic Ways of Knowing*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidas Publishers, 1989.
- Bhatt, S.R. *Reality, Knowledge and Value*. Delhi: Bharatiya Vidya Prakasan, 1985.
- Bhattacharya, Chandrodaya, *The Elements of Indian Logic and Epistemology: A Portion of Annambhatta's Tarkasamgraha and Dipika*. Culcutta: Modern Book Agency Pvt., Ltd., 1966.
- Bijalwan, C.D. *Indian*



**Dr Suresh Babu G.**

Freelance Scholar

### **Conceptualizing Male Gaze in Movies**

*The twentieth century witnessed the collaboration of different arts and production of hybrid forms. Our century had put most rigorously into practice certain theories concerning the interrelatedness of arts in an effort to strengthen the specific effects of singular arts. Cinema has been a most active catalyst in this process. Cinema was first evaluated as an art form in terms of a fantastic amalgamation. Cinema has a capacity to combine arts. Considering the combination of literature and cinematic medium we come across the difference of communication in them, word against image. Both words and images are sets of signs that belong to systems and that, at a certain level of abstraction, these systems bear resemblance to one another. From the moment visual and verbal elements are seen as component parts of one global system, the affinities between the two arts come into focus.*

Films and novels differ in many ways, and because of these differences the way they convey their themes, plots, and characters will necessarily differ. Three of the most obvious differences between films and novels are found in the scale, the level of realism they convey, and the reflection of the author or auteur's ideology. As soon as the makers of cinema recognized that telling a good story in moving pictures required a “good story,” adaptations of novels, plays, and short stories became commonplace. For every literary text each reader “sees” a different vision of the work, so the idea of reality is interpreted by each of those readers. Similarly, filmmakers interpret the “reality” found in a work of literature. But when it gets a film adaptation the final vision reflected will not only be the ideas of the original author, but also the vision of the filmmakers. Sometimes, however, a filmmaker’s attempt to stay true to the original text is thwarted by contemporary sensibilities, and the screenwriter or director’s ideology will come through the film even if it was not present in the original work. So the film adaptation is changed to project messages deemed important by the filmmakers, not by the original author. Thus the changes in literary text and the film adaptation can be observed.

Lenin Rajendran's *Mazha* (2000) is the film adaptation of Kamala Das' 'Nashtappetta Neelambari'(1993). In this Lenin Rajendran tells the story of a woman called Bhadra, who is a doctor by her profession and shows inextricable passion to poetry and music. Kamala Das' 'Nashtappetta Neelambari'the protagonist is portrayed as Subhadra Devi, a woman who enjoys and celebrates the individual freedom. It's not conferred to her by the society but she herself demands it and lives it. In *Mazha* the woman portrayed, Bhadra, is a girl who got conventionalised by the patriarchal forces. Her growth from a girl to a woman marks the advancement of the conventionalisation processes prevalent in society. But this conventionalisation or bounding to the patriarchal forces happen only in her family life. In her professional life she is depicted as a powerful woman with bold professional ethics. Her attempt to assert her individuality at the end through the realization of raga Neelāmbari, which represents her poetry and love, fails at last. *Mazha* presents before us a more conventionalised Bhadra from Subhadra Devi.

The aspect which I scrutiny here is that of the stereotyping of the women character Bhadra, in the film adaptation of "Nashtappetta Neelambari". Bhadra is portrayed as a 'conventional' woman, powerless and weeping character. Stereotyping of women characters is done by fixing them into the notions of the patriarchal society. Feminist critics extended critiques stressing the limited, stereotypical roles assigned to most female characters. Laura Mulvey takes up Freudian psychoanalysis and structuralism in her "Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema" (first published in1975) to argue that mainstream Hollywood narrative films represent women characters as passive objects of male sexual desire. Mulvey's theory of the 'male gaze' claims that male characters are 'bearers of the look' (Bill Nicholas 309) which is aimed at physically desirable, sexually submissive female characters. Moreover, we the spectators watch cinematic films through the eyes of the dominant male

protagonists and are implicitly addressed as though we were men desiring heterosexual pleasures, even if we are heterosexual women or homosexuals.

Mulvey borrows two features of cinematic experience from psychoanalysis to explain the theory of male gaze. First notion is that of scopophilia which means 'pleasure in looking'. Freudian theory suggest that pleasure in looking is a human instinct that develops in the early years of a person's existence when they begin to experience control over their sight and can fix it on various objects, such as toys. Mulvey argues that narrative cinema conventions and contexts of screening foster a sense of 'voyeuristic phantasy' (307) in the spectator, not unlike the infantile variety. Scopophilic desires accommodate male rather than female voyeurs. Female spectators are excluded from the male-oriented perspective on visual pleasure. The type of visual pleasure constructed by mainstream narrative cinema is gendered and sexist. The second feature of narrative cinema is the notion of identification derived from Jacques Lacan's theory of the mirror stage. Mulvey applies Lacan's ideas to cinema spectatorship. The cinema screen functions as the mirror. Spectators are encouraged to identify themselves with on-screen characters and imagine these characters as superior reflection of themselves. The male protagonists who do the looking become the 'main controlling figure with whom the spectator can identify' (310). Women spectators are also bound to identify with this dominant male character. In films there are also female characters who threaten the male ones. These characters are subjected to male gaze in a different sense because their lack of penis signifies for men the threat of castration. These characters have to be killed or incarcerated in order to protect the phallic power of patriarchal identification.

Mulvey concludes with three types of 'looking' associated with the cinema: (i) the look of the camera that records the film, (ii) the look of the audience that views the film and (iii) the look of the characters in the film. Narrative film conventions of realist filmmaking, however makes the first two ways of looking invisible and instead foreground the third perspective, 'the conscious aim being always to eliminate intrusive camera presence and prevent a distancing awareness in the audience' (314). All we are consciously left with, therefore, is the look of the characters in the film, and in most films the bearers of this look are male characters, who are usually looking lustfully at the female characters. Mulvey's theory of the male gaze has been very influential to the film and media theory. All we are consciously left with,

therefore, is the look of the characters in the film, and in most films the bearers of this look are male characters, who are usually looking lustfully at the female characters.

In the film *Mazha* this lustful look is done by Chandran. There are scenes in which he possess voyeuristic gaze towards Bhadra. In scene 36, 37 this look is prominent. In scene 36 we see Bhadra, taking rest after her night duty. Then Chandran starts to look at sleeping Bhadra. He is enjoying the physical beauty of Bhadra through sight. This perspective is adopted by the audience. That is audience observe Bhadra's physical beauty through the look of Chandran. Laura Mulvey says,

The man controls the film phantasy and also emerges as the representative of power in a further sense: as the bearer of the look of the spectator, transferring it behind the screen to neutralise the extradiegetic tendencies represented by woman as spectacle. ... Each is associated with a look: that of the spectator in direct scopophilic contact with the female form displayed for his enjoyment (connoting male phantasy) and that of the spectator fascinated with the image of his like set in an illusion of natural space, and through him gaining control and possession of the woman within the diegesis. ... By means of identification with him, through participation in his power, the spectator can indirectly possess her too (310).

In the scenes we find Bhadra is got forcefully enter into a relation with Chandran. Thus a sexually submissive woman is portrayed. These all come under this male gaze. The commercial film gets its acceptance only in a frame in which the ruling ideology of society is celebrated. The whole customs and conventions of the womanhood, decided by the patriarchal society have to be pleased, then. Bounding to this aspect, *Mazha* portrays a woman of traditions and conventions. The freedom experienced by Madhavikkutty in conceiving and delivering Subhadra is cut short to fix Bhadra to the desired frames of

commercial filming. In such stereotyped figures woman has to be submissive to the wishes of her family. Even without considering her thoughts, hopes and desires she has to fulfill the idea about her, set by the family or parents. She is not present as a self, but she has to be a reality which attends to the needs of people around. She has to be submissive to the male around her. The life of the women ends up with her husband's death. She has to lead a life in full sorrow and has to keep her away from all kinds of happiness. A woman who appears in coloured clothes will not be accepted as a good woman in the society. On the whole she has to be a silent, suffering being without any protest to the exploitation she is having.

Our protagonist Bhadra experience most of this kinds of happenings. She is subjected to the forces of her parents, her husband and society. Even her physical and sexual life is subjected to the wishes of her husband. In scene 52A of *Mazha* we find Chandran compelling Bhadra to sing. He even physically tortures her to make her sing. She faints and falls into his arms. In scene 53 we find Bhadra losing her voice. Even after all these, we find Bhadra trying to love him and to be submissive to Chandran. She loves him and care for him. These all are the stereotyping done in the film. The stereotyping offers the women with no chance to go out of the frame fixed by the society. It gives only a singular perspective to womanhood. The desired goal of a patriarchal society, in framing a submissive female is achieved through this.

As Mulvey observes male gaze done through the male protagonist, here it is done by Chandran. Chandran is the bearer of the look and through his eyes audience experiences the pleasures. The stereotyping of woman characters is done to please the ideas of patriarchal society in current. The inability of Bhadra in effective assertion of her individual self is because of this stereotyping.

### References

- Abraham M H ed. *A Glossary of Literary Terms*. 8<sup>th</sup> ed. New Delhi: Cengage Learning India Pvt Ltd, 2005. Print.
- Bharati, Shivaram. *Women in Indian Literature*. New Delhi: DPS Publishing House, 2010. Print.
- Bhatnagar, Manmohan K, and Rajeshwar M, eds.*Indian Writings in English*. New Delhi: Atlantic Publishers and Distributors, 2000. Print.
- Bruce King. *Modern Poetry in English*. Rev.ed. New Delhi: OUP, 1987. Print.
- Cohen, Keith. *Film and Fiction*. London: Yale University Press, 1979. Print.
- Das, Kamala. "The sunshine Cat". *CompleteClassics.Com*. N.d. Web. 06 June 2012  
<<http://www.completeclassics.com/p/m/poem.asp?poem=30447218&poet=1510732&num=20&total=23>>
- Das, Shubhamoy. "Kali: The Dark Mother: Fearful Goddess with a Heart of a Mother". *About.Com. Hinduism*.1999. Web. 14 May 2012  
<<http://hinduism.about.com/od/hindugoddesses/a/makali.htm>>
- De Beauvoir, Simone. *The Second Sex*. Trans. H M Parshley. London: Vintage, 1997

**Dr Krishnamurthy N. P.**

Assistant Professor in Kannada  
Government First Grade College, Bangalore

## **Indian Role in the Indian Ocean Rim Association**

*India is a peninsular country, covered by bay of Bengal, Arabian Sea and the Indian Ocean. Indian Economic growth depends upon its hold on the peninsula. The Indian Ocean is a gate way of commercial opportunities for India and plays a main role in framing \_The Indian Ocean Rim Association for Regional Co-Operation (IOR-ARC). India has equal part sea with land boundary of 7200 KM. This length of border plays an important role in Indian Defense. Given this context, India has great interests in the IOR-ARC. The IOR-ARC and Indian Ocean Naval Symposium have a good understanding and work in a cooperative manner. This mutual understanding and cooperation with the IOR-ARC countries is vital for the maritime security. As far as the Indian Ocean is concerned, its various channels are responsible for two - thirds of world's oil shipment, one third of world's cargo movement and nearly half of its container traffic movement. The IOR-ARC is an Intergovernmental Organization of 21 Countries coastal states bordering the Indian Ocean.. India have vital role in the organization since beginning of its setup. IOR-ARC constitute for maintain and safeguard for Economical and commercial interest of the countries. But undeclared main purpose is to maintain the power politics and avoid the possibility of power vacuum.*

The Indian Ocean is the world's third largest ocean in the world. It carries half of the world's container ships, one third of the world's bulk cargo traffic and two thirds of the world's oil shipments in international business. It is a become lifeline of international trade and transport. The Indian Ocean Rim is a region comprised of the sovereign states whose share border by the waters of the Indian Ocean. The region is home to around two billion people. It is a region of more cultural diversity and richness in languages, culture, religions, traditions, arts and cuisines. The countries of the Indian Ocean Rim vary considerably in terms of their areas, populations and levels of economic hub and development. They may also be divided and associated into a number of sub-regions like Australasia, Southeast Asia, South Asia, West Asia and Eastern & Southern Africa), each with their own regional groupings, such as ASEAN, SAARC, GCC and SADC.

India is a peninsular country, covered by bay of Bengal, Arabian Sea and The Indian Ocean. Indian Economic growth depends upon its hold on the peninsula. The Indian Ocean is a gate way of commercial opportunities for India and plays a main role in framing \_The Indian Ocean Rim Association for Regional Co-Operation (IOR-ARC). India has equal part sea with land boundary of 7200 KM. This length of border plays an important role in Indian Defense. Given this context, India has great interests in the IOR-ARC. The IOR-ARC and Indian Ocean Naval Symposium have a good understanding and work in a cooperative manner. This mutual understanding and cooperation with the IOR-

ARC countries is vital for the maritime security. As far as the Indian Ocean is concerned, its various channels are responsible for two -

thirds of world's oil shipment, one third of world's cargo movement and nearly half of its container traffic movement. Recently Prime Minister Mr. Modi said, —For us, it also serves as a strategic bridge with the nations in our immediate and extended maritime neighborhood. In March last year in Mauritius, I had spelt out our vision for the Indian Ocean. The Indian Ocean Region is one of my foremost policy priorities. Our approach is evident in our vision of 'Sagar' which means ocean and stands for Security and Growth for all in the region. The IOR-ARC is an Intergovernmental Organization of 21 Countries coastal states bordering the Indian Ocean.. India have vital role in the organization since beginning of its setup. IOR-ARC constitute for maintain and safeguard for Economical and commercial interest of the countries. But undeclared main purpose is to maintain the power politics and avoid the possibility of power vacuum.

IOA-ARC bringing together representatives of Government, Business and Academia, for promoting co-operation and closer interaction among them. It is based on the principles of Open Regionalism for strengthening Economic Cooperation particularly on Trade Facilitation and Investment, Promotion as well as Social Development of the region. The organization was first time established as Indian Ocean Rim Initiative in Mauritius on March 1995 and launched on 6–7 March 1997 by the conclusion of a multilateral treaty known as the Charter of the Indian Ocean Rim Association for Regional Co-operation.

The IOR-ARC with the aim of promoting economic and technical cooperation. IOR-ARC is the only pan-Indian ocean grouping. It brings together countries from three continents having different sizes, economic strengths, and a wide diversity of languages, cultures. It aims to create a platform for trade, socio-economic and cultural cooperation in the Indian Ocean rim area, which constitutes a population of about two billion people. The Indian Ocean Rim is rich in strategic and precious minerals, metals and other natural resources, marine resources and energy, all of which can be sourced from Exclusive Economic Zones (EEZ), continental shelves and the deep seabed.

The Indian Ocean Rim Association (IORA) Leaders' Summit was recently held in Jakarta, capital of Indonesia from March 5 to 7, 2017. The theme of the summit was 'Strengthening Maritime Cooperation for a Peaceful, Stable and Prosperous Indian Ocean'. It was attended by leaders from 21 member states namely. Highlights of IOR-ARC 2017: It drew attention on issues of regional interest such as maritime security, disaster relief and humanitarian assistance, fisheries management, people. 21 member states issued a strategic vision document known as the Jakarta Concord. It sets out a vision strengthening the regional architecture to face. It also issued Joint Declaration of the IORA



business Community to build partnership for a sustainable and equitable economic growth.

It also adopted IORA Action Plan, a document containing the implementation actions of the Jakarta Concord to strengthen the implementation of priority. The Declaration on Preventing and Countering Terrorism and Violent Extremism was also adopted, stating importance of countering terrorism. The Declaration on Preventing and Countering Terrorism and Violent Extremism was also adopted, stating importance of countering terrorism. The member nations stressed on the need to work together in order to eliminate the growth and spread of terrorism and violent extremism.

To promote sustainable growth and balanced development of the region and member states. To focus on those areas of economic cooperation which provide maximum opportunities for development, shared interest and mutual benefits. To promote liberalization, remove impediments and lower barriers towards a freer and enhanced flow of goods, services, investment, and technology within the Indian Ocean rim. Indian Ocean Rim Association (IORA) has identified six priority areas, namely: Maritime Security, Trade and Investment facilitation, fisheries management, disaster risk reduction, academic and scientific cooperation and tourism promotion and cultural exchanges.

The Main objectives of the Association are as follows: Firstly to promote the sustained growth and balanced development of the region and of the Member States, and to create common ground for regional economic co-operation. Secondly to focus on those areas of economic co-operation which provide maximum opportunities to develop shared interests and reap mutual benefits. Thirdly to explore all possibilities and avenues for trade liberalization, to remove impediments to, and lower barriers towards, freer and enhanced flow of goods, services, investment, and technology.

Fourthly to encourage close interaction of trade and industry, academic institutions, scholars and the peoples of the Member States without any discrimination among Member States and without prejudice to obligations under other regional economic and trade co-operation arrangements. Fifthly to strengthen co-operation and dialogue among Member States in international forum on global economic issues, and where desirable to develop shared strategies and take common positions in the international forum on issues of mutual interest; and sixthly to promote co-operation in development of human resources, particularly through closer linkages among training institutions, universities and other specialized institutions of the Member States.

In July 2016, IORA featured in the Joint Statement between President of South Africa and Prime Minister of India on the occasion of the official visit of the Indian Prime Minister to South Africa. President Zuma noted that IORA gained new momentum with India as Chair (2011-12) and committed that it will be South Africa's objective to ensure that this momentum is

sustained during its incoming Chairpersonship (2017-18). Both leaders noted the importance of the Ocean Economy, growing interest by other countries to join the organization as dialogue partners, and the strategic nature the Indian Ocean can play in developing the Region.

Indian Ocean Dialogue was launched as an Indian initiative. India hosted the first Indian Ocean Dialogue in Kochi, Kerala from September 5-7, 2015 as a Track 1.5 event bringing together Official, Academics and other Strategic thinkers. The participants discussed six broad themes—the geopolitical contours of the Indian Ocean Region (IOR), maritime security challenges, strengthening regional institutions, information sharing, cooperation in disaster relief and management, and economic cooperation. Kochi Consensus was adopted as the outcome document of the First Indian Ocean Dialogue.

### References

- Antarastiya Sambandhagalu : Dr. Jayaramu: KanvaPrakashana  
Antarastiya Sambandhagalu: Prof. HalappaAnkitahPrakashana  
<https://www.mea.gov.in/in-focus-article.htm?20707/Indian+Ocean+Rim+Association+for+Regional+Cooperation+IORARC>  
[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Indian-Ocean\\_Rim\\_Association](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Indian-Ocean_Rim_Association)  
<http://www.iora.int/en>  
<http://www.iasparliament.com/current-affairs/iora-summit-2017>  
<http://www.hsrb.ac.za/uploads/pageContent/6606/Growing%20strength%20of%20IORA.pdf>  
<https://www.iaspreparationonline.com/indian-ocean-rim-ior-arc/>

**Submission of Papers**

**The Investigator** is published quarterly (March, June, September and December) It welcomes original, scholarly unpublished papers from the researchers, faculty members, students and the diverse aspirants writing in English. All contributions should follow the methodology of a research paper. The cover page of your paper should contain the title of your paper, author name, designation, official address, email address etc. Contributors should adhere strict academic ethics. Papers can be submitted throughout the year. You are advised to submit your papers online with a brief abstract of the paper to the following email address:

acsrinternational@gmail.com

**For Subscription & Enquiries**

Mobile: +919947116804, +919946138576

acsrinternational@gmail.com

**www.acsrinternational.com**

ISSN 2454-3314

*The Investigator* is an International Peer-Reviewed Multidisciplinary Journal published quarterly (March, June, September and December), launched under the auspices of the academic community *Association for Cultural & Scientific Research* (ACSR). Keeping the panoramic scopes of research as a vibrant path, *The Investigator* intends to reflect on the skilled minds attitudinally conjuring from humanities to other disciplines. The journal explores the currents of criticism and unleashes divergent thinking.

June 2023  
(Vol. 9, No. 2)



Association for Cultural & Scientific Research  
[www.acsrinternational.com](http://www.acsrinternational.com)